

BEFORE THE BOARD OF DISCIPLINARY APPEALS APPOINTED BY THE SUPREME COURT OF TEXAS

§

§

8

IN THE MATTER OF GWENDOLYN F. CLIMMONS STATE BAR CARD NO. 04390000

CAUSE NO. 55907

PETITION FOR COMPULSORY DISCIPLINE

TO THE BOARD OF DISCIPLINARY APPEALS:

Petitioner, the Commission for Lawyer Discipline (hereinafter called "Petitioner"), brings this action against Respondent, Gwendolyn F. Climmons (hereinafter called "Respondent"), showing as follows:

1. This action is commenced by Petitioner pursuant to Part VIII of the Texas Rules of Disciplinary Procedure. Petitioner is also providing Respondent a copy of this Board's procedures for handling a compulsory discipline matter by attaching a copy of such procedures to this petition.

2. Respondent, Gwendolyn F. Climmons, may be served with a true and correct copy of this Petition for Compulsory Discipline, its attachments, as well as a notice of hearing, at Gwendolyn F. Climmons, SPN# 01229675, Harris county Jail, 1200 Baker Street, Houston, Texas 77002.

3. On or about April 26, 2012, Respondent was charged by Indictment (Exhibit 1) with Count 1 – Conspiracy to Commit Health Care Fraud, in violation of 18 U.S.C. § 1349, and Counts 2-5 – Health Care Fraud, in violation of 18 U.S.C. §§ 1347 and 2, in Cause No. H-12-245, styled *United States of America, Plaintiff, v. Gwendolyn Climmons-Johnson, Defendant,* in the United States District Court for the Southern District of Texas, Houston Division.

4. On or about June 13, 2014, a Judgment in a Criminal Case (Exhibit 2) was imposed in Case No.4:12CR00245-001, styled United States of America v. Gwendolyn Climmons-Johnson, in the United States District Court for the Southern District of Texas, Holding Session in Houston, wherein Respondent was found guilty of Count 1 – Conspiracy to commit healthcare fraud, in violation of 18 U.S.C. §§ 1347 and 1349; Counts 2, 4 – Health care fraud, aiding and abetting, in violation of 18 U.S.C. §§ 1347 and 2; and Counts 3,5 – Health care fraud, aiding and abetting, in violation of 18 U.S.C. §§ 1347 and 2, and was committed to the custody of the United States Bureau of Prisons to be imprisoned for a term of 97 months as to each of Counts 1 through 5, to run concurrently, for a total term of 97 months. Respondent was ordered upon release from imprisonment to be on supervised release for 3 years, ordered to pay an assessment of \$500.00 and restitution in the amount of \$972,132.22. Attached hereto and made a part hereof for all intents and purposes as if the same were copied verbatim herein, are true and correct copies of the following documents in the Climmons-Johnson criminal case: Indictment (Exhibit 1) and Judgment in a Criminal Case (Exhibit 2). Petitioner expects to introduce certified copies of Exhibits 1 and 2 at the time of hearing of this cause.

5. Respondent, Gwendolyn F. Climmons, whose bar card number is 04390000, is the same person as the Gwendolyn Climmons-Johnson who is the subject of the Indictment and Judgment described above, true and correct copies of which are attached hereto as Exhibits 1 and 2.

6. Attached hereto as Exhibit 3 and made a part hereof for all intents and purposes as if the same were copied verbatim herein is a true and correct copy of an affidavit of Rebecca (Beth) Stevens, Attorney of Record for Petitioner herein, attesting to the fact that Respondent is the same person as the person who is the subject of the Indictment and Judgment entered in the Climmons-Johnson criminal case. Petitioner expects to introduce the original of said affidavit at the time of hearing of this cause.

7. The offenses for which Respondent was convicted are intentional crimes as defined by Rule 1.06(T), Texas Rules of Disciplinary Procedure. They are as well serious crimes as defined by Rule 1.06(Z), Texas Rules of Disciplinary Procedure.

8. Having been found guilty and having been convicted of intentional crimes and such conviction currently being appealed, Respondent should be suspended as an attorney licensed to practice law in Texas during the appeal of her conviction. Further, upon a showing by Petitioner that the conviction has become final after determination of the appeal, Respondent should be disbarred as provided by Rule 8.05, Texas Rules of Disciplinary Procedure.

PRAYER

WHEREFORE, PREMISES CONSIDERED, Petitioner prays that Respondent be given notice of these proceedings as provided by law and, upon hearing of this matter, that the Board enter its order suspending Respondent during the appeal of her conviction, and for such other and further relief to which Petitioner may be entitled to receive including costs of court and attorney's fees.

Respectfully submitted,

Linda A. Acevedo Chief Disciplinary Counsel

Rebecca (Beth) Stevens Assistant Disciplinary Counsel Office of the Chief Disciplinary Counsel STATE BAR OF TEXAS P.O. Box 12487, Capitol Station Austin, Texas 78711-2487 Telephone: 512.427.1350 Facsimile: 512.427.4167 Email: <u>Bstevens@texasbar.com</u>

Rebecca (Beth) Stevens State Bar Card No. 24065381 ATTORNEYS FOR PETITIONER

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true and correct copy of the foregoing instrument has been sent for personal service on Gwendolyn F. Climmons, SPN# 01229675, Harris county Jail, 1200 Baker Street, Houston, Texas 77002, on this Aday of March 2015.

M Jerry Beth) Stevens

NOTICE OF HEARING

NOTICE IS HEREBY GIVEN that a trial on the merits of the Petition for Compulsory Discipline heretofore sent to be filed with the Board of Disciplinary Appeals on this day, will be held in the courtroom of the Supreme Court of Texas, Tom C. Clark Building, 14th and Colorado Streets, Austin, Texas, at 9:00 a.m. on the 1st day of May 2015.

Rebecca (Beth) Stevens

INTERNAL PROCEDURAL RULES

Board of Disciplinary Appeals

Effective February 19, 2015

Contents

SECTION 1: GENERAL PROVISIONS	1
Rule 1.01 Definitions	1
Rule 1.02 General Powers	1
Rule 1.03 Additional Rules in Disciplinary Matters	1
Rule 1.04 Appointment of Panels	1
Rule 1.05 Filing of Pleadings, Motions, and Other Papers	1
Rule 1.06 Service of Petition	2
Rule 1.07 Hearing Setting and Notice	2
Rule 1.08 Time to Answer	3
Rule 1.09 Pretrial Procedure	3
Rule 1.10 Decisions	3
Rule 1.11 Board of Disciplinary Appeals Opinions	3
Rule 1.12 BODA Work Product and Drafts	4
Rule 1.13 Record Retention	4
Rule 1.14 Costs of Reproduction of Records	4
Rule 1.15 Publication of These Rules	4
SECTION 2: ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS	4
Rule 2.01 Representing or Counseling Parties in Disciplinary Matters and Legal Malpractice Cases	4
Rule 2.02 Confidentiality	4
Rule 2.03 Disqualification and Recusal of BODA Members	4
SECTION 3: CLASSIFICATION APPEALS	5
Rule 3.01 Notice of Right to Appeal	5
Rule 3.02 Record on Appeal	5
SECTION 4: APPEALS FROM EVIDENTIARY PANEL HEARINGS	5
Rule 4.01 Perfecting Appeal	5
Rule 4.02 Record on Appeal	5
Rule 4.03 Time to File Record	7
Rule 4.04 Copies of the Record	8
Rule 4.05 Requisites of Briefs	8
Rule 4.06 Oral Argument	9
Rule 4.07 Decision and Judgment	9
Rule 4.08 Appointment of Statewide Grievance Committee	9
Rule 4.09 Involuntary Dismissal	10
SECTION 5: PETITIONS TO REVOKE PROBATION	10

Rule 5.01 Initiation and Service	
Rule 5.02 Hearing	
SECTION 6: COMPULSORY DISCIPLINE	
Rule 6.01 Initiation of Proceeding	
Rule 6.02 Interlocutory Suspension	
SECTION 7: RECIPROCAL DISCIPLINE	
Rule 7.01 Initiation of Proceeding	11
Rule 7.02 Order to Show Cause	
Rule 7.03 Attorney's Response	11
SECTION 8: DISTRICT DISABILITY COMMITTEE HEARINGS	
Rule 8.01 Appointment of District Disability Committee	11
Rule 8.02 Petition and Answer	11
Rule 8.03 Discovery	11
Rule 8.04 Ability to Compel Attendance	
Rule 8.05 Respondent's Right to Counsel	
Rule 8.06 Hearing	
Rule 8.07 Notice of Decision	
Rule 8.08 Confidentiality	
SECTION 9: DISABILITY REINSTATEMENTS	
Rule 9.01 Petition for Reinstatement	
Rule 9.02 Discovery	
Rule 9.03 Physical or Mental Examinations	
Rule 9.04 Judgment	
SECTION 10: APPEALS FROM BODA TO THE SUPREME COURT OF TEXAS	
Rule 10.01 Appeals to the Supreme Court	

SECTION 1: GENERAL PROVISIONS

Rule 1.01 Definitions

- (a) "BODA" is the Board of Disciplinary Appeals.
- (b) "Chair" is the member elected by BODA to serve as chair or, in the Chair's absence, the member elected by BODA to serve as vicechair.
- (c) "Classification" is the determination by the CDC under TRDP 2.10 or by BODA under TRDP 7.08(C) whether a grievance constitutes a "complaint" or an "inquiry."
- (d) "BODA Clerk" is the executive director of BODA or other person appointed by BODA to assume all duties normally performed by the clerk of a court.
- (e) "CDC" is the Chief Disciplinary Counsel for the State Bar of Texas and his or her assistants.
- (f) "Commission" is the Commission for Lawyer Discipline, a permanent committee of the State Bar of Texas.
- (g) "Executive Director" is the executive director of BODA.
- (h) "Panel" is any three-member grouping of BODA under TRDP 7.05.
- (i) "Party" is a Complainant, a Respondent, or the Commission.
- (j) "TDRPC" is the Texas Disciplinary Rules of Professional Conduct.
- (k) "TRAP" is the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure.
- (1) "TRCP" is the Texas Rules of Civil Procedure.
- (m) "TRDP" is the Texas Rules of Disciplinary Procedure.
- (n) "TRE" is the Texas Rules of Evidence.

Rule 1.02 General Powers

Under TRDP 7.08, BODA has and may exercise all the powers of either a trial court or an appellate court, as the case may be, in hearing and determining disciplinary proceedings. But TRDP 15.01 applies to the enforcement of a judgment of BODA.

Rule 1.03 Additional Rules in Disciplinary Matters

Except as varied by these rules and to the extent applicable, the TRCP, TRAP, and TRE apply to all disciplinary matters before BODA, except for appeals from classification decisions, which are governed by TRDP 2.10 and by Section 3 of these rules.

Rule 1.04 Appointment of Panels

- (a) BODA may consider any matter or motion by panel, except as specified in (b). The Chair may delegate to the Executive Director the duty to appoint a panel for any BODA action. Decisions are made by a majority vote of the panel; however, any panel member may refer a matter for consideration by BODA sitting en banc. Nothing in these rules gives a party the right to be heard by BODA sitting en banc.
- (b) Any disciplinary matter naming a BODA member as Respondent must be considered by BODA sitting en banc. A disciplinary matter naming a BODA staff member as Respondent need not be heard en banc.

Rule 1.05 Filing of Pleadings, Motions, and Other Papers

- (a) **Electronic Filing.** All documents must be filed electronically. Unrepresented persons or those without the means to file electronically may electronically file documents, but it is not required.
 - (1) **Email Address.** The email address of an attorney or an unrepresented party who electronically files a document must be included on the document.
 - (2) Timely Filing. Documents are filed electronically by emailing the document to the BODA Clerk at the email address designated by BODA for that purpose. A document filed by email will be considered filed the day that the email is sent. The date sent is the date shown for the message in the inbox of the email account designated for receiving filings. If a document is sent after 5:00 p.m. or on a weekend or holiday officially observed by the State of Texas, it is considered filed the next business day.
 - (3) It is the responsibility of the party filing a document by email to obtain the correct email address for BODA and to confirm that the document was received by BODA in legible form. Any document that is illegible or that cannot be opened as part of an email attachment will not be considered filed. If a document is untimely due to a technical failure or a system outage, the filing party may seek appropriate relief from BODA.

(4) Exceptions.

- An appeal to BODA of a decision by the CDC to classify a grievance as an inquiry is not required to be filed electronically.
- (ii) The following documents must not be filed electronically:
 - a) documents that are filed under seal or subject to a pending motion to seal; and
 - b) documents to which access is otherwise restricted by court order.
- (iii) For good cause, BODA may permit a party to file other documents in paper form in a particular case.
- (5) **Format.** An electronically filed document must:
 - (i) be in text-searchable portable document format (PDF);
 - (ii) be directly converted to PDF rather than scanned, if possible; and
 - (iii) not be locked.
- (b) A paper will not be deemed filed if it is sent to an individual BODA member or to another address other than the address designated by BODA under Rule 1.05(a)(2).
- (c) Signing. Each brief, motion, or other paper filed must be signed by at least one attorney for the party or by the party pro se and must give the State Bar of Texas card number, mailing address, telephone number, email address, and fax number, if any, of each attorney whose name is signed or of the party (if applicable). A document is considered signed if the document includes:
 - (1) an "/s/" and name typed in the space where the signature would otherwise appear, unless the document is notarized or sworn; or
 - (2) an electronic image or scanned image of the signature.
- (d) **Paper Copies.** Unless required by BODA, a party need not file a paper copy of an electronically filed document.
- (e) **Service.** Copies of all documents filed by any party other than the record filed by the evidentiary panel clerk or the court reporter

must, at or before the time of filing, be served on all other parties as required and authorized by the TRAP.

Rule 1.06 Service of Petition

In any disciplinary proceeding before BODA initiated by service of a petition on the Respondent, the petition may be served by personal service; by certified mail with return receipt requested; or, if permitted by BODA, in any other manner that is authorized by the TRCP and reasonably calculated under all the circumstances to apprise the Respondent of the proceeding and to give him or her reasonable time to appear and answer. To establish service by certified mail, the return receipt must contain the Respondent's signature.

Rule 1.07 Hearing Setting and Notice

- (a) Original Petitions. In any kind of case initiated by the CDC's filing a petition or motion with BODA, the CDC may contact the BODA Clerk for the next regularly available hearing date before filing the original petition. If a hearing is set before the petition is filed, the petition must state the date, time, and place of the hearing. Except in the case of a petition to revoke probation under TRDP 2.23, the hearing date must be at least 30 days from the date that the petition is served on the Respondent.
- (b) **Expedited Settings.** If a party desires a hearing on a matter on a date earlier than the next regularly available BODA hearing date, the party may request an expedited setting in a written motion setting out the reasons for the request. Unless the parties agree otherwise, and except in the case of a petition to revoke probation under TRDP 2.23, the expedited hearing setting must be at least 30 days from the date of service of the petition, motion, or other pleading. BODA has the sole discretion to grant or deny a request for an expedited hearing date.
- (c) **Setting Notices.** BODA must notify the parties of any hearing date that is not noticed in an original petition or motion.
- (d) Announcement Docket. Attorneys and parties appearing before BODA must confirm their presence and present any questions regarding procedure to the BODA Clerk in the courtroom immediately prior to the time docket call is scheduled to begin. Each party with a matter on the docket must appear at the docket call to give an announcement of readiness, to give a time estimate for the

hearing, and to present any preliminary motions or matters. Immediately following the docket call, the Chair will set and announce the order of cases to be heard.

Rule 1.08 Time to Answer

The Respondent may file an answer at any time, except where expressly provided otherwise by these rules or the TRDP, or when an answer date has been set by prior order of BODA. BODA may, but is not required to, consider an answer filed the day of the hearing.

Rule 1.09 Pretrial Procedure

- (a) Motions.
 - (1) Generally. To request an order or other relief, a party must file a motion supported by sufficient cause with proof of service on all other parties. The motion must state with particularity the grounds on which it is based and set forth the relief sought. All supporting briefs, affidavits, or other documents must be served and filed with the motion. A party may file a response to a motion at any time before BODA rules on the motion or by any deadline set by BODA. Unless otherwise required by these rules or the TRDP, the form of a motion must comply with the TRCP or the TRAP.
 - (2) **For Extension of Time.** All motions for extension of time in any matter before BODA must be in writing, comply with (a)(1), and specify the following:
 - (i) if applicable, the date of notice of decision of the evidentiary panel, together with the number and style of the case;
 - (ii) if an appeal has been perfected, the date when the appeal was perfected;
 - (iii) the original deadline for filing the item in question;
 - (iv) the length of time requested for the extension;
 - (v) the number of extensions of time that have been granted previously regarding the item in question; and
 - (vi) the facts relied on to reasonably explain the need for an extension.
- (b) **Pretrial Scheduling Conference.** Any party may request a pretrial scheduling conference,

or BODA on its own motion may require a pretrial scheduling conference.

- (c) **Trial Briefs.** In any disciplinary proceeding before BODA, except with leave, all trial briefs and memoranda must be filed with the BODA Clerk no later than ten days before the day of the hearing.
- (d) Hearing Exhibits, Witness Lists, and Exhibits Tendered for Argument. A party may file a witness list, exhibit, or any other document to be used at a hearing or oral argument before the hearing or argument. A party must bring to the hearing an original and 12 copies of any document that was not filed at least one business day before the hearing. The original and copies must be:
 - (1) marked;
 - (2) indexed with the title or description of the item offered as an exhibit; and
 - (3) if voluminous, bound to lie flat when open and tabbed in accordance with the index.

All documents must be marked and provided to the opposing party before the hearing or argument begins.

Rule 1.10 Decisions

- (a) **Notice of Decisions.** The BODA Clerk must give notice of all decisions and opinions to the parties or their attorneys of record.
- (b) **Publication of Decisions.** BODA must report judgments or orders of public discipline:
 - (1) as required by the TRDP; and
 - (2) on its website for a period of at least ten years following the date of the disciplinary judgment or order.
- (c) Abstracts of Classification Appeals. BODA may, in its discretion, prepare an abstract of a classification appeal for a public reporting service.

Rule 1.11 Board of Disciplinary Appeals Opinions

(a) BODA may render judgment in any disciplinary matter with or without written opinion. In accordance with TRDP 6.06, all written opinions of BODA are open to the public and must be made available to the public reporting services, print or electronic, for publishing. A majority of the members who participate in considering the disciplinary matter must determine if an opinion will be written. The names of the participating members must be noted on all written opinions of BODA.

- (b) Only a BODA member who participated in the decision of a disciplinary matter may file or join in a written opinion concurring in or dissenting from the judgment of BODA. For purposes of this rule, in hearings in which evidence is taken, no member may participate in the decision unless that member was present at the hearing. In all other proceedings, no member may participate unless that member has reviewed the record. Any member of BODA may file a written opinion in connection with the denial of a hearing or rehearing en banc.
- (c) A BODA determination in an appeal from a grievance classification decision under TRDP 2.10 is not a judgment for purposes of this rule and may be issued without a written opinion.

Rule 1.12 BODA Work Product and Drafts

A document or record of any nature—regardless of its form, characteristics, or means of transmission—that is created or produced in connection with or related to BODA's adjudicative decision-making process is not subject to disclosure or discovery. This includes documents prepared by any BODA member, BODA staff, or any other person acting on behalf of or at the direction of BODA.

Rule 1.13 Record Retention

Records of appeals from classification decisions must be retained by the BODA Clerk for a period of at least three years from the date of disposition. Records of other disciplinary matters must be retained for a period of at least five years from the date of final judgment, or for at least one year after the date a suspension or disbarment ends, whichever is later. For purposes of this rule, a record is any document, paper, letter, map, book, tape, photograph, film, recording, or other material filed with BODA, regardless of its form, characteristics, or means of transmission.

Rule 1.14 Costs of Reproduction of Records

The BODA Clerk may charge a reasonable amount for the reproduction of nonconfidential records filed with BODA. The fee must be paid in advance to the BODA Clerk.

Rule 1.15 Publication of These Rules

These rules will be published as part of the TDRPC and TRDP.

SECTION 2: ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

Rule 2.01 Representing or Counseling Parties in Disciplinary Matters and Legal Malpractice Cases

- (a) A current member of BODA must not represent a party or testify voluntarily in a disciplinary action or proceeding. Any BODA member who is subpoenaed or otherwise compelled to appear at a disciplinary action or proceeding, including at a deposition, must promptly notify the BODA Chair.
- (b) A current BODA member must not serve as an expert witness on the TDRPC.
- (c) A BODA member may represent a party in a legal malpractice case, provided that he or she is later recused in accordance with these rules from any proceeding before BODA arising out of the same facts.

Rule 2.02 Confidentiality

- (a) BODA deliberations are confidential, must not be disclosed by BODA members or staff, and are not subject to disclosure or discovery.
- (b) Classification appeals, appeals from evidentiary judgments of private reprimand, appeals from an evidentiary judgment dismissing a case, interlocutory appeals or any interim proceedings from an ongoing evidentiary case, and disability cases are confidential under the TRDP. BODA must maintain all records associated with these cases as confidential, subject to disclosure only as provided in the TRDP and these rules.
- (c) If a member of BODA is subpoenaed or otherwise compelled by law to testify in any proceeding, the member must not disclose a matter that was discussed in conference in connection with a disciplinary case unless the member is required to do so by a court of competent jurisdiction.

Rule 2.03 Disqualification and Recusal of BODA Members

- (a) BODA members are subject to disqualification and recusal as provided in TRCP 18b.
- (b) BODA members may, in addition to recusals under (a), voluntarily recuse themselves from any discussion and voting for any reason. The reasons that a BODA member is recused from a case are not subject to discovery.
- (c) These rules do not disqualify a lawyer who is a member of, or associated with, the law firm of

a BODA member from serving on a grievance committee or representing a party in a disciplinary proceeding or legal malpractice case. But a BODA member must recuse himor herself from any matter in which a lawyer who is a member of, or associated with, the BODA member's firm is a party or represents a party.

SECTION 3: CLASSIFICATION APPEALS

Rule 3.01 Notice of Right to Appeal

- (a) If a grievance filed by the Complainant under TRDP 2.10 is classified as an inquiry, the CDC must notify the Complainant of his or her right to appeal as set out in TRDP 2.10 or another applicable rule.
- (b) To facilitate the potential filing of an appeal of a grievance classified as an inquiry, the CDC must send the Complainant an appeal notice form, approved by BODA, with the classification disposition. The form must include the docket number of the matter; the deadline for appealing; and information for mailing, faxing, or emailing the appeal notice form to BODA. The appeal notice form must be available in English and Spanish.

Rule 3.02 Record on Appeal

BODA must only consider documents that were filed with the CDC prior to the classification decision. When a notice of appeal from a classification decision has been filed, the CDC must forward to BODA a copy of the grievance and all supporting documentation. If the appeal challenges the classification of an amended grievance, the CDC must also send BODA a copy of the initial grievance, unless it has been destroyed.

SECTION 4: APPEALS FROM EVIDENTIARY PANEL HEARINGS

Rule 4.01 Perfecting Appeal

- (a) **Appellate Timetable.** The date that the evidentiary judgment is signed starts the appellate timetable under this section. To make TRDP 2.21 consistent with this requirement, the date that the judgment is signed is the "date of notice" under Rule 2.21.
- (b) **Notification of the Evidentiary Judgment.** The clerk of the evidentiary panel must notify the parties of the judgment as set out in TRDP 2.21.
 - (1) The evidentiary panel clerk must notify the Commission and the Respondent in writing of the judgment. The notice must

contain a clear statement that any appeal of the judgment must be filed with BODA within 30 days of the date that the judgment was signed. The notice must include a copy of the judgment rendered.

- (2) The evidentiary panel clerk must notify the Complainant that a judgment has been rendered and provide a copy of the judgment, unless the evidentiary panel dismissed the case or imposed a private reprimand. In the case of a dismissal or private reprimand, the evidentiary panel clerk must notify the Complainant of the decision and that the contents of the judgment are confidential. Under TRDP 2.16, no additional information regarding the contents of a judgment of dismissal or private reprimand may be disclosed to the Complainant.
- (c) **Filing Notice of Appeal.** An appeal is perfected when a written notice of appeal is filed with BODA. If a notice of appeal and any other accompanying documents are mistakenly filed with the evidentiary panel clerk, the notice is deemed to have been filed the same day with BODA, and the evidentiary panel clerk must immediately send the BODA Clerk a copy of the notice and any accompanying documents.
- (d) Time to File. In accordance with TRDP 2.24, the notice of appeal must be filed within 30 days after the date the judgment is signed. In the event a motion for new trial or motion to modify the judgment is timely filed with the evidentiary panel, the notice of appeal must be filed with BODA within 90 days from the date the judgment is signed.
- (e) **Extension of Time.** A motion for an extension of time to file the notice of appeal must be filed no later than 15 days after the last day allowed for filing the notice of appeal. The motion must comply with Rule 1.09.

Rule 4.02 Record on Appeal

- (a) **Contents.** The record on appeal consists of the evidentiary panel clerk's record and, where necessary to the appeal, a reporter's record of the evidentiary panel hearing.
- (b) **Stipulation as to Record.** The parties may designate parts of the clerk's record and the reporter's record to be included in the record

on appeal by written stipulation filed with the clerk of the evidentiary panel.

(c) Responsibility for Filing Record.

- (1) Clerk's Record.
 - After receiving notice that an appeal has been filed, the clerk of the evidentiary panel is responsible for preparing, certifying, and timely filing the clerk's record.
 - (ii) Unless the parties stipulate otherwise, the clerk's record on appeal must contain the items listed in TRAP 34.5(a) and any other paper on file with the evidentiary panel, including the election letter, all pleadings on which the hearing was held, the docket sheet, the evidentiary panel's charge, any findings of fact and conclusions of law, all other pleadings, the judgment or other orders appealed from, the notice of decision sent to each party, any postsubmission pleadings and briefs, and the notice of appeal.
 - (iii) If the clerk of the evidentiary panel is unable for any reason to prepare and transmit the clerk's record by the due date, he or she must promptly notify BODA and the parties, explain why the clerk's record cannot be timely filed, and give the date by which he or she expects the clerk's record to be filed.
- (2) Reporter's Record.
 - (i) The court reporter for the evidentiary panel is responsible for timely filing the reporter's record if:
 - a) a notice of appeal has been filed;
 - b) a party has requested that all or part of the reporter's record be prepared; and
 - c) the party requesting all or part of the reporter's record has paid the reporter's fee or has made satisfactory arrangements with the reporter.
 - (ii) If the court reporter is unable for any reason to prepare and transmit the reporter's record by the due date, he

or she must promptly notify BODA and the parties, explain the reasons why the reporter's record cannot be timely filed, and give the date by which he or she expects the reporter's record to be filed.

- (d) Preparation of Clerk's Record.
 - (1) To prepare the clerk's record, the evidentiary panel clerk must:
 - gather the documents designated by the parties' written stipulation or, if no stipulation was filed, the documents required under (c)(1)(ii);
 - (ii) start each document on a new page;
 - (iii) include the date of filing on each document;
 - (iv) arrange the documents in chronological order, either by the date of filing or the date of occurrence;
 - (v) number the pages of the clerk's record in the manner required by (d)(2);
 - (vi) prepare and include, after the front cover of the clerk's record, a detailed table of contents that complies with (d)(3); and
 - (vii) certify the clerk's record.
 - (2) The clerk must start the page numbering on the front cover of the first volume of the clerk's record and continue to number all pages consecutively including the front and back covers, tables of contents, certification page, and separator pages, if any—until the final page of the clerk's record, without regard for the number of volumes in the clerk's record, and place each page number at the bottom of each page.
 - (3) The table of contents must:
 - (i) identify each document in the entire record (including sealed documents); the date each document was filed; and, except for sealed documents, the page on which each document begins;
 - (ii) be double-spaced;

- (iii) conform to the order in which documents appear in the clerk's record, rather than in alphabetical order;
- (iv) contain bookmarks linking each description in the table of contents (except for descriptions of sealed documents) to the page on which the document begins; and
- (v) if the record consists of multiple volumes, indicate the page on which each volume begins.
- (e) **Electronic Filing of the Clerk's Record.** The evidentiary panel clerk must file the record electronically. When filing a clerk's record in electronic form, the evidentiary panel clerk must:
 - (1) file each computer file in text-searchable Portable Document Format (PDF);
 - (2) create electronic bookmarks to mark the first page of each document in the clerk's record;
 - (3) limit the size of each computer file to 100 MB or less, if possible; and
 - (4) directly convert, rather than scan, the record to PDF, if possible.
- (f) Preparation of the Reporter's Record.
 - (1) The appellant, at or before the time prescribed for perfecting the appeal, must make a written request for the reporter's record to the court reporter for the evidentiary panel. The request must designate the portion of the evidence and other proceedings to be included. A copy of the request must be filed with the evidentiary panel and BODA and must be served on the appellee. The reporter's record must be certified by the court reporter for the evidentiary panel.
 - (2) The court reporter or recorder must prepare and file the reporter's record in accordance with TRAP 34.6 and 35 and the Uniform Format Manual for Texas Reporters' Records.
 - (3) The court reporter or recorder must file the reporter's record in an electronic format by emailing the document to the email address designated by BODA for that purpose.
 - (4) The court reporter or recorder must

include either a scanned image of any required signature or "/s/" and name typed in the space where the signature would otherwise

- (6) In exhibit volumes, the court reporter or recorder must create bookmarks to mark the first page of each exhibit document.
- (g) **Other Requests.** At any time before the clerk's record is prepared, or within ten days after service of a copy of appellant's request for the reporter's record, any party may file a written designation requesting that additional exhibits and portions of testimony be included in the record. The request must be filed with the evidentiary panel and BODA and must be served on the other party.
- (h) Inaccuracies or Defects. If the clerk's record is found to be defective or inaccurate, the BODA Clerk must inform the clerk of the evidentiary panel of the defect or inaccuracy and instruct the clerk to make the correction. Any inaccuracies in the reporter's record may be corrected by agreement of the parties without the court reporter's recertification. Any dispute regarding the reporter's record that the parties are unable to resolve by agreement must be resolved by the evidentiary panel.
- (i) Appeal from Private Reprimand. Under TRDP 2.16, in an appeal from a judgment of private reprimand, BODA must mark the record as confidential, remove the attorney's name from the case style, and take any other steps necessary to preserve the confidentiality of the private reprimand.

Rule 4.03 Time to File Record

(a) Timetable. The clerk's record and reporter's record must be filed within 60 days after the date the judgment is signed. If a motion for new trial or motion to modify the judgment is filed with the evidentiary panel, the clerk's record and the reporter's record must be filed within 120 days from the date the original judgment is signed, unless a modified judgment is signed, in which case the clerk's record and the reporter's record must be filed within 60 days of the signing of the modified judgment. Failure to file either the clerk's record or the reporter's record on time does not affect BODA's jurisdiction, but may result in BODA's exercising its discretion to dismiss the appeal, affirm the judgment appealed from,

disregard materials filed late, or apply presumptions against the appellant.

(b) If No Record Filed.

- (1) If the clerk's record or reporter's record has not been timely filed, the BODA Clerk must send notice to the party responsible for filing it, stating that the record is late and requesting that the record be filed within 30 days. The BODA Clerk must send a copy of this notice to all the parties and the clerk of the evidentiary panel.
- (2) If no reporter's record is filed due to appellant's fault, and if the clerk's record has been filed, BODA may, after first giving the appellant notice and a reasonable opportunity to cure, consider and decide those issues or points that do not require a reporter's record for a decision. BODA may do this if no reporter's record has been filed because:
 - (i) the appellant failed to request a reporter's record; or
 - (ii) the appellant failed to pay or make arrangements to pay the reporter's fee to prepare the reporter's record, and the appellant is not entitled to proceed without payment of costs.
- (c) Extension of Time to File the Reporter's Record. When an extension of time is requested for filing the reporter's record, the facts relied on to reasonably explain the need for an extension must be supported by an affidavit of the court reporter. The affidavit must include the court reporter's estimate of the earliest date when the reporter's record will be available for filing.
- (d) **Supplemental Record.** If anything material to either party is omitted from the clerk's record or reporter's record, BODA may, on written motion of a party or on its own motion, direct a supplemental record to be certified and transmitted by the clerk for the evidentiary panel or the court reporter for the evidentiary panel.

Rule 4.04 Copies of the Record

The record may not be withdrawn from the custody of the BODA Clerk. Any party may obtain a copy of the record or any designated part thereof by making a written request to the BODA Clerk and paying any charges for reproduction in advance.

Rule 4.05 Requisites of Briefs

- (a) **Appellant's Filing Date.** Appellant's brief must be filed within 30 days after the clerk's record or the reporter's record is filed, whichever is later.
- (b) **Appellee's Filing Date.** Appellee's brief must be filed within 30 days after the appellant's brief is filed.
- (c) Contents. Briefs must contain:
 - (1) a complete list of the names and addresses of all parties to the final decision and their counsel;
 - (2) a table of contents indicating the subject matter of each issue or point, or group of issues or points, with page references where the discussion of each point relied on may be found;
 - (3) an index of authorities arranged alphabetically and indicating the pages where the authorities are cited;
 - (4) a statement of the case containing a brief general statement of the nature of the cause or offense and the result;
 - (5) a statement, without argument, of the basis of BODA's jurisdiction;
 - (6) a statement of the issues presented for review or points of error on which the appeal is predicated;
 - (7) a statement of facts that is without argument, is supported by record references, and details the facts relating to the issues or points relied on in the appeal;
 - (8) the argument and authorities;
 - (9) conclusion and prayer for relief;
 - (10) a certificate of service; and
 - (11) an appendix of record excerpts pertinent to the issues presented for review.
- (d) Length of Briefs; Contents Included and Excluded. In calculating the length of a document, every word and every part of the document, including headings, footnotes, and quotations, must be counted except the following: caption, identity of the parties and counsel, statement regarding oral argument, table of contents, index of authorities, statement of the case, statement of issues presented, statement of the jurisdiction,

signature, proof of service, certificate of compliance, and appendix. Briefs must not exceed 15,000 words if computer-generated, and 50 pages if not, except on leave of BODA. A reply brief must not exceed 7,500 words if computer-generated, and 25 pages if not, except on leave of BODA. A computergenerated document must include a certificate by counsel or the unrepresented party stating the number of words in the document. The person who signs the certification may rely on the word count of the computer program used to prepare the document.

- (e) **Amendment or Supplementation.** BODA has discretion to grant leave to amend or supplement briefs.
- (f) **Failure of the Appellant to File a Brief.** If the appellant fails to timely file a brief, BODA may:
 - dismiss the appeal for want of prosecution, unless the appellant reasonably explains the failure, and the appellee is not significantly injured by the appellant's failure to timely file a brief;
 - (2) decline to dismiss the appeal and make further orders within its discretion as it considers proper; or
 - (3) if an appellee's brief is filed, regard that brief as correctly presenting the case and affirm the evidentiary panel's judgment on that brief without examining the record.

Rule 4.06 Oral Argument

- (a) Request. A party desiring oral argument must note the request on the front cover of the party's brief. A party's failure to timely request oral argument waives the party's right to argue. A party who has requested argument may later withdraw the request. But even if a party has waived oral argument, BODA may direct the party to appear and argue. If oral argument is granted, the clerk will notify the parties of the time and place for submission.
- (b) Right to Oral Argument. A party who has filed a brief and who has timely requested oral argument may argue the case to BODA unless BODA, after examining the briefs, decides that oral argument is unnecessary for any of the following reasons:
 - (1) the appeal is frivolous;

- (2) the dispositive issue or issues have been authoritatively decided;
- (3) the facts and legal arguments are adequately presented in the briefs and record; or
- (4) the decisional process would not be significantly aided by oral argument.
- (c) **Time Allowed.** Each party will have 20 minutes to argue. BODA may, on the request of a party or on its own, extend or shorten the time allowed for oral argument. The appellant may reserve a portion of his or her allotted time for rebuttal.

Rule 4.07 Decision and Judgment

- (a) **Decision.** BODA may do any of the following:
 - (1) affirm in whole or in part the decision of the evidentiary panel;
 - (2) modify the panel's findings and affirm the findings as modified;
 - (3) reverse in whole or in part the panel's findings and render the decision that the panel should have rendered; or
 - (4) reverse the panel's findings and remand the cause for further proceedings to be conducted by:
 - (i) the panel that entered the findings; or
 - (ii) a statewide grievance committee panel appointed by BODA and composed of members selected from the state bar districts other than the district from which the appeal was taken.
- (b) **Mandate.** In every appeal, the BODA Clerk must issue a mandate in accordance with BODA's judgment and send it to the evidentiary panel and to all the parties.

Rule 4.08 Appointment of Statewide Grievance Committee

If BODA remands a cause for further proceedings before a statewide grievance committee, the BODA Chair will appoint the statewide grievance committee in accordance with TRDP 2.27. The committee must consist of six members: four attorney members and two public members randomly selected from the current pool of grievance committee members. Two alternates, consisting of one attorney and one public member, must also be selected. BODA will appoint the initial chair who will serve until the members of the statewide grievance committee elect a chair of the committee at the first meeting. The BODA Clerk will notify the Respondent and the CDC that a committee has been appointed.

Rule 4.09 Involuntary Dismissal

Under the following circumstances and on any party's motion or on its own initiative after giving at least ten days' notice to all parties, BODA may dismiss the appeal or affirm the appealed judgment or order. Dismissal or affirmance may occur if the appeal is subject to dismissal:

- (a) for want of jurisdiction;
- (b) for want of prosecution; or
- (c) because the appellant has failed to comply with a requirement of these rules, a court order, or a notice from the clerk requiring a response or other action within a specified time.

SECTION 5: PETITIONS TO REVOKE PROBATION

Rule 5.01 Initiation and Service

- (a) Before filing a motion to revoke the probation of an attorney who has been sanctioned, the CDC must contact the BODA Clerk to confirm whether the next regularly available hearing date will comply with the 30-day requirement of TRDP. The Chair may designate a three-member panel to hear the motion, if necessary, to meet the 30-day requirement of TRDP 2.23.
- (b) Upon filing the motion, the CDC must serve the Respondent with the motion and any supporting documents in accordance with TRDP 2.23, the TRCP, and these rules. The CDC must notify BODA of the date that service is obtained on the Respondent.

Rule 5.02 Hearing

Within 30 days of service of the motion on the Respondent, BODA must docket and set the matter for a hearing and notify the parties of the time and place of the hearing. On a showing of good cause by a party or on its own motion, BODA may continue the case to a future hearing date as circumstances require.

SECTION 6: COMPULSORY DISCIPLINE

Rule 6.01 Initiation of Proceeding

Under TRDP 8.03, the CDC must file a petition for compulsory discipline with BODA and serve the

Respondent in accordance with the TRDP and Rule 1.06 of these rules.

Rule 6.02 Interlocutory Suspension

- **Interlocutory Suspension.** In any compulsory (a) proceeding under TRDP Part VIII in which BODA determines that the Respondent has been convicted of an Intentional Crime and that the criminal conviction is on direct appeal, BODA may suspend the Respondent's license to practice law by interlocutory order. In any compulsory case in which BODA has imposed an interlocutory order of suspension, BODA retains jurisdiction to render final judgment after the direct appeal of the criminal conviction is final. For purposes of rendering final judgment in a compulsory discipline case, the direct appeal of the criminal conviction is final when the appellate court issues its mandate.
- (b) **Criminal Conviction Affirmed.** If the criminal conviction made the basis of a compulsory interlocutory suspension is affirmed and becomes final, the CDC must file a motion for final judgment that complies with TRDP 8.05.
 - (1) If the criminal sentence is fully probated or is an order of deferred adjudication, the motion for final judgment must contain notice of a hearing date. The motion will be set on BODA's next available hearing date.
 - (2) If the criminal sentence is not fully probated:
 - BODA may proceed to decide the motion without a hearing if the attorney does not file a verified denial within ten days of service of the motion; or
 - (ii) BODA may set the motion for a hearing on the next available hearing date if the attorney timely files a verified denial.
- (c) Criminal Conviction Reversed. If an appellate court issues a mandate reversing the criminal conviction while a Respondent is subject to an interlocutory suspension, the Respondent may file a motion to terminate the interlocutory suspension. The motion to terminate the interlocutory suspension must have certified copies of the decision and mandate of the reversing court attached. If the CDC does not file an opposition to the termination within ten

days of being served with the motion, BODA may proceed to decide the motion without a hearing or set the matter for a hearing on its own motion. If the CDC timely opposes the motion, BODA must set the motion for a hearing on its next available hearing date. An order terminating an interlocutory order of suspension does not automatically reinstate a Respondent's license.

SECTION 7: RECIPROCAL DISCIPLINE

Rule 7.01 Initiation of Proceeding

The Commission for Lawyer Discipline may initiate an action for reciprocal discipline by filing a petition with BODA under TRDP Part IX and these rules. The petition must request that the Respondent be disciplined in Texas and have attached to it any information concerning the disciplinary matter from the other jurisdiction, including a certified copy of the order or judgment rendered against the Respondent.

Rule 7.02 Order to Show Cause

When a petition is filed, the Chair immediately issues a show cause order and a hearing notice and forwards them to the CDC, who must serve the order and notice on the Respondent. The CDC must notify BODA of the date that service is obtained.

Rule 7.03 Attorney's Response

If the Respondent does not file an answer within 30 days of being served with the order and notice but thereafter appears at the hearing, BODA may, at the discretion of the Chair, receive testimony from the Respondent relating to the merits of the petition.

SECTION 8: DISTRICT DISABILITY COMMITTEE HEARINGS

Rule 8.01 Appointment of District Disability Committee

- (a) If the evidentiary panel of the grievance committee finds under TRDP 2.17(P)(2), or the CDC reasonably believes under TRDP 2.14(C), that a Respondent is suffering from a disability, the rules in this section will apply to the de novo proceeding before the District Disability Committee held under TRDP Part XII.
- (b) Upon receiving an evidentiary panel's finding or the CDC's referral that an attorney is believed to be suffering from a disability, the BODA Chair must appoint a District Disability Committee in compliance with TRDP 12.02 and designate a chair. BODA will reimburse District Disability Committee

members for reasonable expenses directly related to service on the District Disability Committee. The BODA Clerk must notify the CDC and the Respondent that a committee has been appointed and notify the Respondent where to locate the procedural rules governing disability proceedings.

- (c) A Respondent who has been notified that a disability referral will be or has been made to BODA may, at any time, waive in writing the appointment of the District Disability Committee or the hearing before the District Disability Committee and enter into an agreed judgment of indefinite disability suspension, provided that the Respondent is competent to waive the hearing. If the Respondent is not represented, the waiver must include a statement affirming that the Respondent has been advised of the right to appointed counsel and waives that right as well.
- (d) All pleadings, motions, briefs, or other matters to be filed with the District Disability Committee must be filed with the BODA Clerk.
- (e) Should any member of the District Disability Committee become unable to serve, the BODA Chair may appoint a substitute member.

Rule 8.02 Petition and Answer

- (a) Petition. Upon being notified that the District Disability Committee has been appointed by BODA, the CDC must, within 20 days, file with the BODA Clerk and serve on the Respondent a copy of a petition for indefinite disability suspension. Service may be made in person or by certified mail, return receipt requested. If service is by certified mail, the return receipt with the Respondent's signature must be filed with the BODA Clerk.
- (b) Answer. The Respondent must, within 30 days after service of the petition for indefinite disability suspension, file an answer with the BODA Clerk and serve a copy of the answer on the CDC.
- (c) **Hearing Setting.** The BODA Clerk must set the final hearing as instructed by the chair of the District Disability Committee and send notice of the hearing to the parties.

Rule 8.03 Discovery

(a) **Limited Discovery.** The District Disability Committee may permit limited discovery. The

party seeking discovery must file with the BODA Clerk a written request that makes a clear showing of good cause and substantial need and a proposed order. If the District Disability Committee authorizes discovery in a case, it must issue a written order. The order may impose limitations or deadlines on the discovery.

- (b) Physical or Mental Examinations. On written motion by the Commission or on its own motion, the District Disability Committee may order the Respondent to submit to a physical or mental examination by a qualified healthcare or mental healthcare professional. Nothing in this rule limits the Respondent's right to an examination by a professional of his or her choice in addition to any exam ordered by the District Disability Committee.
 - (1) **Motion.** The Respondent must be given reasonable notice of the examination by written order specifying the name, address, and telephone number of the person conducting the examination.
 - (2) **Report.** The examining professional must file with the BODA Clerk a detailed, written report that includes the results of all tests performed and the professional's findings, diagnoses, and conclusions. The professional must send a copy of the report to the CDC and the Respondent.
- (c) **Objections.** A party must make any objection to a request for discovery within 15 days of receiving the motion by filing a written objection with the BODA Clerk. BODA may decide any objection or contest to a discovery motion.

Rule 8.04 Ability to Compel Attendance

The Respondent and the CDC may confront and cross-examine witnesses at the hearing. Compulsory process to compel the attendance of witnesses by subpoena, enforceable by an order of a district court of proper jurisdiction, is available to the Respondent and the CDC as provided in TRCP 176.

Rule 8.05 Respondent's Right to Counsel

(a) The notice to the Respondent that a District Disability Committee has been appointed and the petition for indefinite disability suspension must state that the Respondent may request appointment of counsel by BODA to represent him or her at the disability hearing. BODA will reimburse appointed counsel for reasonable expenses directly related to representation of the Respondent.

(b) To receive appointed counsel under TRDP 12.02, the Respondent must file a written request with the BODA Clerk within 30 days of the date that Respondent is served with the petition for indefinite disability suspension. A late request must demonstrate good cause for the Respondent's failure to file a timely request.

Rule 8.06 Hearing

The party seeking to establish the disability must prove by a preponderance of the evidence that the Respondent is suffering from a disability as defined in the TRDP. The chair of the District Disability Committee must admit all relevant evidence that is necessary for a fair and complete hearing. The TRE are advisory but not binding on the chair.

Rule 8.07 Notice of Decision

The District Disability Committee must certify its finding regarding disability to BODA, which will issue the final judgment in the matter.

Rule 8.08 Confidentiality

All proceedings before the District Disability Committee and BODA, if necessary, are closed to the public. All matters before the District Disability Committee are confidential and are not subject to disclosure or discovery, except as allowed by the TRDP or as may be required in the event of an appeal to the Supreme Court of Texas.

SECTION 9: DISABILITY REINSTATEMENTS

Rule 9.01 Petition for Reinstatement

- (a) An attorney under an indefinite disability suspension may, at any time after he or she has been suspended, file a verified petition with BODA to have the suspension terminated and to be reinstated to the practice of law. The petitioner must serve a copy of the petition on the CDC in the manner required by TRDP 12.06. The TRCP apply to a reinstatement proceeding unless they conflict with these rules.
- (b) The petition must include the information required by TRDP 12.06. If the judgment of disability suspension contained terms or conditions relating to misconduct by the petitioner prior to the suspension, the petition must affirmatively demonstrate that those terms have been complied with or explain why they have not been satisfied. The petitioner has

a duty to amend and keep current all information in the petition until the final hearing on the merits. Failure to do so may result in dismissal without notice.

(c) Disability reinstatement proceedings before BODA are not confidential; however, BODA may make all or any part of the record of the proceeding confidential.

Rule 9.02 Discovery

The discovery period is 60 days from the date that the petition for reinstatement is filed. The BODA Clerk will set the petition for a hearing on the first date available after the close of the discovery period and must notify the parties of the time and place of the hearing. BODA may continue the hearing for good cause shown.

Rule 9.03 Physical or Mental Examinations

- (a) On written motion by the Commission or on its own, BODA may order the petitioner seeking reinstatement to submit to a physical or mental examination by a qualified healthcare or mental healthcare professional. The petitioner must be served with a copy of the motion and given at least seven days to respond. BODA may hold a hearing before ruling on the motion but is not required to do so.
- (b) The petitioner must be given reasonable notice of the examination by written order specifying the name, address, and telephone number of the person conducting the examination.
- (c) The examining professional must file a detailed, written report that includes the results of all tests performed and the professional's findings, diagnoses, and conclusions. The professional must send a copy of the report to the parties.
- (d) If the petitioner fails to submit to an examination as ordered, BODA may dismiss the petition without notice.
- (e) Nothing in this rule limits the petitioner's right to an examination by a professional of his or her choice in addition to any exam ordered by BODA.

Rule 9.04 Judgment

If, after hearing all the evidence, BODA determines that the petitioner is not eligible for reinstatement, BODA may, in its discretion, either enter an order denying the petition or direct that the petition be held in abeyance for a reasonable period of time until the petitioner provides additional proof as directed by BODA. The judgment may include other orders necessary to protect the public and the petitioner's potential clients.

SECTION 10: APPEALS FROM BODA TO THE SUPREME COURT OF TEXAS

Rule 10.01 Appeals to the Supreme Court

- (a) A final decision by BODA, except a determination that a statement constitutes an inquiry or a complaint under TRDP 2.10, may be appealed to the Supreme Court of Texas. The clerk of the Supreme Court of Texas must docket an appeal from a decision by BODA in the same manner as a petition for review without fee.
- (b) The appealing party must file the notice of appeal directly with the clerk of the Supreme Court of Texas within 14 days of receiving notice of a final determination by BODA. The record must be filed within 60 days after BODA's determination. The appealing party's brief is due 30 days after the record is filed, and the responding party's brief is due 30 days thereafter. The BODA Clerk must send the parties a notice of BODA's final decision that includes the information in this paragraph.
- (c) An appeal to the Supreme Court is governed by TRDP 7.11 and the TRAP.

District of Texas FILED

APR 26 2012

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS HOUSTON DIVISION

David J. Bradley, Clerk of Court

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA	§
	§
v.	§
	ş
GWENDOLYN CLIMMONS-JOHNSON	١Š
	ş
	ş
Defendant.	§

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

Criminaryo.	12	-24	5
UNDER SEAL			

ale

a have be charge a

UNSEAL

PER ARREST

The Grand Jury charges:

General Allegations

INDICTMENT

At all times material to this Indictment, unless otherwise specified:

The Medicare Program ("Medicare") was a federal healthcare program providing 1. benefits to individuals who were over the age of 65 or disabled. Medicare was administered by the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services ("CMS"), a federal agency under the United States Department of Health and Human Services. Medicare was a "healthcare benefit program" as defined by Title 18, United States Code, Section 24(b).

2. Medicare was subdivided into multiple Parts. Medicare Part B covered ambulance transportation services.

3. Individuals who qualified for Medicare benefits were commonly referred to as "Medicare beneficiaries." Each Medicare beneficiary was given a Medicare identification number.

4. The Medicare payment benefit for ambulance services was very restricted. Medicare covered ambulance services only if furnished to a beneficiary whose medical condition at the time of transport was such that transportation by other means would endanger the patient's

> TTUE COPY I CERTIFY ATTEST: VID J. BRADLE Clerk of Con

Exhibit

health. A patient whose condition permitted transport in any type of vehicle other than an ambulance did not qualify for Medicare payment. Medicare payment for ambulance transportation depended on the patient's condition at the actual time of the transport regardless of the patient's diagnosis. To be deemed medically necessary for payment, the patient must have required both the transportation and the level of service provided.

5. Ambulance transportation was only covered when the patient's condition required the vehicle itself and/or the specialized services of the trained ambulance personnel. A requirement of coverage was that the needed services of the ambulance personnel were provided and clear clinical documentation validated the medical need and the provision in the record of the service (usually the run sheet).

6. Ambulance services were only covered in the absence of an emergency condition under either of the following circumstances: (1) the patient being transported could not be transported by any other means from the origin to the destination without endangering the individual's health or (2) the patient was before, during and after transportation, bed confined. For purposes of Medicare coverage, "bed confined" meant the patient met all of the following three criteria: (1) unable to get up from bed without assistance, (2) unable to ambulate and (3) unable to sit in a chair (including a wheelchair).

7. A thorough assessment and documented description of the patient's current state was essential for coverage. All statements about the patient's medical condition or bed-bound status must have been validated in the documentation using contemporaneous objective observations and findings.

8. For ambulance services to have been covered by Medicare, the transport must have been to the nearest institution with appropriate facilities for the treatment of the illness or

injury involved. The term "appropriate facilities" meant that the institution was generally equipped to provide hospital care necessary to manage the illness or injury involved. Covered destinations for non-emergency transports included: (1) hospitals; (2) skilled nursing facilities; (3) dialysis facilities; (4) from a skilled nursing facility to the nearest supplier of medically necessary services not available at the skilled nursing facility where the beneficiary was a resident, including the return trip, when the patient's condition at the time of transport required ambulance services; and (5) the patient's residence only if the transport was to return from a hospital and the patient's condition at the time of transport required ambulance services.

9. A community mental health center ("CMHC") was an entity that provided outpatient services for individuals who were chronically mentally ill and residents of its service area who had been discharged from inpatient treatment at a mental health facility. A CMHC may also have provided 24-hour emergency care services and partial hospitalization or psychosocial rehabilitation services.

10. Medicare did not cover ambulance transport from a beneficiary's home to a CMHC because a CMHC was not a hospital, skilled nursing facility or dialysis center.

11. For scheduled non-emergency ambulance transports, providers of ambulance transportation were required to obtain a written physician's certification statement ("PCS") from the patient's attending physician certifying that the medical necessity requirements for ambulance transportation were met. The signature of the medical professional completing the PCS was required to be legible (or accompanied by a typed or written name) and include credentials. Furthermore, the PCS was required to be signed and dated at the time it was completed. For repetitive, non-emergency transports, the following rules applied: (1) a PCS for repetitive transports must have been signed by the patient's attending physician and (2) the PCS

must have been dated no earlier than 60 days in advance of the transport for those patients who required repetitive ambulance services and whose transportation was scheduled in advance.

12. Medicare required the run report to include a description of the patient's symptoms and physical findings in sufficient detail as to demonstrate conditions severe enough to justify payment for ambulance transportation services.

13. Medicare did not cover transportation in vans, privately-owned vehicles, taxicabs, . Ambi-buses, ambulettes or Medi-cabs.

14. CMS contracted with Medicare Administrative Contractors ("MACs") to process claims for payment. The MAC that processed and paid Medicare Part B claims in Texas was TrailBlazer Health Enterprises, LLC ("TrailBlazer").

15. To bill Medicare for services rendered, a provider submitted a claim form (Form 1500) to TrailBlazer. When a Form 1500 was submitted, usually in electronic form, the provider certified:

a. the contents of the form were true, correct and complete;

 the form was prepared in compliance with the laws and regulations governing Medicare; and

c. the services being billed were medically necessary.

16. A Medicare claim for payment was required to set forth, among other things, the following: the beneficiary's name and unique Medicare identification number; the item or service provided; and the cost of the item or service.

Urgent Response Emergency Medical Services, LLC ("Urgent Response") was a
 Texas business entity purportedly doing business at 810 Chelsea Blvd, Houston, Texas 77002.
 Among other things, Urgent Response billed Medicare for ambulance transport services from

beneficiaries' homes to hospitals when the beneficiaries were actually transported to CMHCs rather than hospitals, and Urgent Response also billed Medicare for ambulance transport services that were not medically necessary.

18. Defendant **GWENDOLYN CLIMMONS-JOHNSON**, a resident of Harris County, Texas, was an owner, President and operator of Urgent Response.

<u>COUNT 1</u> Conspiracy to Commit Health Care Fraud (18.S.C. § 1349)

19. Paragraphs 1 through 18 of this Indictment are realleged and incorporated by reference as if fully set forth herein.

20. From in or around April 2009, through December 2011, the exact dates being unknown to the Grand Jury, in the Houston Division of the Southern District of Texas, and elsewhere, Defendant,

GWENDOLYN CLIMMONS-JOHNSON

did knowingly and willfully combine, conspire, confederate and agree with others known and unknown to the Grand Jury, to violate Title 18, United States Code, Section 1347, that is, to execute a scheme and artifice to defraud a healthcare benefit program affecting commerce, as defined in Title 18, United States Code, Section 24(b), that is, Medicare, and to obtain, by means of materially false and fraudulent pretenses, representations and promises, money and property owned by, and under the custody and control of, said healthcare benefit program, in connection with the delivery of and payment for healthcare benefits, items and services.

Purpose of the Conspiracy

21. It was a purpose of the conspiracy for the Defendant and others to unlawfully enrich themselves by (a) submitting false and fraudulent claims to Medicare, (b) concealing the

submission of false and fraudulent claims to Medicare and the receipt and transfer of proceeds from the fraud, and (c) diverting proceeds of the fraud for the personal use and benefit of the Defendant and their co-conspirators.

Manner and Means of the Conspiracy

The manner and means by which the Defendant sought to accomplish the purpose and object of the conspiracy included, among other things:

22. Defendant **GWENDOLYN CLIMMONS-JOHNSON** would maintain a valid Medicare provider number for Urgent Response to submit claims to Medicare for ambulance services that were miscoded, not medically necessary and not provided.

23. Defendant **GWENDOLYN CLIMMONS-JOHNSON** would direct others to transport Medicare beneficiaries in an Urgent Response ambulance.

24. Defendant **GWENDOLYN CLIMMONS-JOHNSON** would control the day-today operations of Urgent Response.

25. Defendant **GWENDOLYN CLIMMONS-JOHNSON** would submit claims to Medicare for ambulance services that were miscoded, not medically necessary and not provided.

26. Defendant **GWENDOLYN CLIMMONS-JOHNSON** would submit approximately \$2,373,758.77 in claims to Medicare for ambulance services that were miscoded, not medically necessary and not provided.

27. After payments from Medicare were deposited into Urgent Response bank accounts, Defendant **GWENDOLYN CLIMMONS-JOHNSON** would transfer proceeds of the fraud to themselves and their co-conspirators.

All in violation of Title 18, United States Code, Section 1349.

<u>COUNTS 2-5</u> Health Care Fraud

(18 U.S.C. §§ 1347 and 2)

28. Paragraphs 1 through 18 and 22 through 27 of this Indictment are realleged and incorporated by reference as though fully set forth herein.

29. On or about the dates specified as to each count below, in the Houston Division of the Southern District of Texas, and elsewhere, Defendant,

GWENDOLYN CLIMMONS-JOHNSON

aiding and abetting others known and unknown to the Grand Jury, in connection with the delivery of an payment for healthcare benefits, items and services, did knowingly and willfully execute and attempt to execute, a scheme and artifice to defraud a healthcare benefit program affecting commerce, as defined in Title 18, United States Code, Section 24(b), that is, Medicare, and to obtain by means of materially false and fraudulent pretenses, representations and promises, money and property owned by and under the custody and control of Medicare.

	<u>Count</u>	<u>Medicare</u> <u>Beneficiary</u>	<u>Approx.</u> <u>Date of</u> <u>Services</u>	Description of Services Billed	Approx. Amount of <u>Claim</u>
•	2	R.G.	8/18/2011	Ambulance Transport	\$1,136
	3	R.G.	8/24/2011	Ambulance Transport	\$1,184
	4	B.J.	8/18/2011	Ambulance Transport	\$1,100
	5	B.J.	8/24/2011	Ambulance Transport	\$1,136

In violation of Title 18, United States Code, Sections 1347 and 2.

NOTICE OF CRIMINAL FORFEITURE (18 U.S.C. §§ 982(a)(7))

30. Pursuant to Title 18, United States Code, Section 982(a)(7), the United States of America gives notice to the Defendant, **GWENDOLYN CLIMMONS-JOHNSON**, that, in the event of conviction for any of the violations charged in Counts One through Five of the Indictment, the United States intends to forfeit all property, real or personal, that constitutes or is derived, directly or indirectly, from gross proceeds traceable to the commission of any such offense, including but not limited to, a money judgment in the amount of at least \$949,833.30 in United States currency, for which the Defendant may be jointly and severally liable.

31. In the event that the property subject to forfeiture as a result of any act or omission of a defendant:

- a. cannot be located upon the exercise of due diligence;
- b. has been transferred or sold to, or deposited with, a third party;
- c. has been placed beyond the jurisdiction of the court;
- d. has been substantially diminished in value; or
- e. has been commingled with other property which cannot be divided without difficulty,

it is the intent of the United States to seek forfeiture of any other property of the Defendant up to the total value of the property subject to forfeiture, pursuant to Title 21, United States Code, Section 853(p), incorporated by reference in Title 18, United States Code, Section 982(b)(1).

A TRUE BILL ,

Original Signature on File

FOREPERSON

KENNETH MAGIDSON UNITED STATES ATTORNEY

WILLIAM PERICAK ASSISTANT CHIEF LAURA M.K. CORDOVA TRIAL ATTORNEY CRIMINAL DIVISION, FRAUD SECTION U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE

ÅÖ 245B	(Rev. 09/08)35 Sheet 1	ing men 1 i 2 a Chin Ma 2 4 5	Document 96	Filed in TXSD on 06/20/	'14 Page 1 of 6	
		Unit	Southern D	S DISTRICT COU istrict of Texas ssion in Houston	IRT	
	UNITED S	TATES OF AME V.	RICA	JUDGMENT IN A	CRIMINAL CAS	SE
G	WENDOLYI	N CLIMMONS-JO	DHNSON	CASE NUMBER: 4:12CR00 USM NUMBER: 12596-379	245-001	
□ See Additional Aliases. THE DEFENDANT:			Cornel A. Williams Defendant's Attorney			
 plead whic was fafter 	a plea of not gui	ere to count(s) by the court. ount(s) <u>1 through 5 (</u> lty.	on October 30, 2013.			
Title & 18 U.S.C 1349 18 U.S.C	Section . §§ 1347 and . §§ 1347 and 2	ted guilty of these offer <u>Nature of Offens</u> Conspiracy to commi Health care fraud, aid Health care fraud, aid	e t health care fraud ing and abetting		Offense Ended 12/31/2011 08/18/2011 08/24/2011	<u>Count</u> 1 2, 4 3, 5
The	dditional Counts of G defendant is se encing Reform	ntenced as provided	in pages 2 through	<u>6</u> of this judgment. The sente	ence is imposed pursua	int to

П	The defendant	has been	found not	milty on	count(s)
and the second	The detendant	nas oven	round not	guney on	(Ound S)

 \Box Count(s)

 \Box is \Box are dismissed on the motion of the .

It is ordered that the defendant must notify the United States attorney for this district within 30 days of any change of name, residence, or mailing address until all fines, restitution, costs, and special assessments imposed by this judgment are fully paid. If ordered to pay restitution, the defendant must notify the court and United States attorney of material changes in economic circumstances.

June 13, 2014 Date of Imposition of Judgment

Signature of Judge

	A HARMON STATES DISTRICT JUDGE	
Name and	Title of Judge	
June 20,	2014	pit 1
Date	ATTEST:	
	D. VID JURADLEY, Clerk of Court	
	By Deputy Clerk	8

IMPRISONMENT

The defendant is hereby committed to the custody of the United States Bureau of Prisons to be imprisoned for a

total term of 97 months. This term consists of NINETY-SEVEN (97) MONTHS as to each of Counts 1 through 5, to run concurrently, for a total term of NINETY-SEVEN (97) MONTHS.

See Additional Imprisonment Terms.

The court makes the following recommendations to the Bureau of Prisons:

I The defendant is remanded to the custody of the United States Marshal.

The defendant shall surrender to the United States Marshal for this district:

□ at ______ □ a.m. □ p.m. on ______.

as notified by the United States Marshal.

The defendant shall surrender for service of sentence at the institution designated by the Bureau of Prisons:

before 2 p.m. on _____

as notified by the United States Marshal.

 \Box as notified by the Probation or Pretrial Services Office.

RETURN

I have executed this judgment as follows:

Defendant delivered on ______ to _____

Ву _____

_____, with a certified copy of this judgment. at

UNITED STATES MARSHAL

DEPUTY UNITED STATES MARSHAL

Judgment -- Page 2 of 6

Judgment -- Page 3 of 6

SUPERVISED RELEASE

Upon release from imprisonment, the defendant shall be on supervised release for a term of: <u>3 years</u>. This term consists of THREE (3) YEARS as to each of Counts 1 through 5, to run concurrently, for a total of THREE (3) YEARS.

See Additional Supervised Release Terms.

The defendant must report to the probation office in the district to which the defendant is released within 72 hours of release from the custody of the Bureau of Prisons.

The defendant shall not commit another federal, state or local crime.

The defendant shall not unlawfully possess a controlled substance. The defendant shall refrain from any unlawful use of a controlled substance. The defendant shall submit to one drug test within 15 days of release from imprisonment and at least two periodic drug tests thereafter, as determined by the court. (for offenses committed on or after September 13, 1994)

The above drug testing condition is suspended, based on the court's determination that the defendant poses a low risk of future substance abuse. (Check, if applicable.)

The defendant shall not possess a firearm, ammunition, destructive device, or any other dangerous weapon. (Check, if applicable.)

- The defendant shall cooperate in the collection of DNA as directed by the probation officer. (Check, if applicable.)
- □ The defendant shall comply with the requirements of the Sex Offender Registration and Notification Act (42 U.S.C. § 16901, *et seq.*) as directed by the probation officer, the Bureau of Prisons, or any state registration in which he or she resides, works, is a student, or was convicted of a qualifying offense. (Check, if applicable)

The defendant shall participate in an approved program for domestic violence. (Check, if applicable.)

If this judgment imposes a fine or restitution, it is a condition of supervised release that the defendant pay in accordance with the Schedule of Payments sheet of this judgment.

The defendant must comply with the standard conditions that have been adopted by this court as well as with any additional conditions on the attached page.

STANDARD CONDITIONS OF SUPERVISION

- See Special Conditions of Supervision.
- 1) the defendant shall not leave the judicial district without the permission of the court or probation officer;
- 2) the defendant shall report to the probation officer and shall submit a truthful and complete written report within the first five days of each month;
- 3) the defendant shall answer truthfully all inquiries by the probation officer and follow the instructions of the probation officer;
- 4) the defendant shall support his or her dependents and meet other family responsibilities;
- 5) the defendant shall work regularly at a lawful occupation, unless excused by the probation officer for schooling, training, or other acceptable reasons;
- 6) the defendant shall notify the probation officer at least ten days prior to any change in residence or employment;
- 7) the defendant shall refrain from excessive use of alcohol and shall not purchase, possess, use, distribute, or administer any controlled substance or any paraphernalia related to any controlled substances, except as prescribed by a physician;
- 8) the defendant shall not frequent places where controlled substances are illegally sold, used, distributed, or administered;
- 9) the defendant shall not associate with any persons engaged in criminal activity and shall not associate with any person convicted of a felony, unless granted permission to do so by the probation officer;
- 10) the defendant shall permit a probation officer to visit him or her at any time at home or elsewhere and shall permit confiscation of any contraband observed in plain view of the probation officer;
- 11) the defendant shall notify the probation officer within seventy-two hours of being arrested or questioned by a law enforcement officer;
- 12) the defendant shall not enter into any agreement to act as an informer or a special agent of a law enforcement agency without the permission of the court; and
- 13) as directed by the probation officer, the defendant shall notify third parties of risks that may be occasioned by the defendant's criminal record or personal history or characteristics and shall permit the probation officer to make such notifications and to confirm the defendant's compliance with such notification requirement.

SPECIAL CONDITIONS OF SUPERVISION

The defendant shall provide the probation officer access to any requested financial information. If a fine or restitution amount has been imposed, the defendant is prohibited from incurring new credit charges or opening additional lines of credit without approval of the probation officer.

The defendant is prohibited from employment or acting in a fiduciary role during the term of supervision.

The defendant is prohibited from any involvement with a Government benefit program, including but not limited to Medicare and Medicaid, unless first authorized by the Court.

The defendant is required to provide the probation officer with written documentation that the State Bar of Texas has been notified of her conviction.

CRIMINAL MONETARY PENALTIES

то		sessment 00.00	<u>Fine</u>	<u>Restituti</u> \$972,132	
	See Additional Terms for Criminal Moneta	ry Penalties.			
	The determination of restitution is of will be entered after such determination		An A	mended Judgment in a Crimin	al Case (AO 245C)
\boxtimes	The defendant must make restitution	on (including community restit	tution) to the follo	wing payees in the amount list	ed below.
	If the defendant makes a partial pay the priority order or percentage pay before the United States is paid.				
	ne of Payee dicare		<u>Total Loss</u> *	Restitution Ordered \$972,132.22	Priority or Percentage
	See Additional Restitution Payees. TALS		<u>\$0.00</u>	<u>\$972,132.22</u>	
	Restitution amount ordered pursuan	nt to plea agreement \$	annun mund des saat de het wat de het de het de het de het de het de		
\boxtimes	The defendant must pay interest on fifteenth day after the date of the ju to penalties for delinquency and de	adgment, pursuant to 18 U.S.C	. § 3612(f). All of		
	The court determined that the defer	ndant does not have the ability	to pay interest and	d it is ordered that:	
	the interest requirement is wait	ved for the \Box fine \Box restit	ution.		
	the interest requirement for the	e \Box fine \Box restitution is mo	odified as follows:		
	Based on the Government's motion Therefore, the assessment is hereby	-	ole efforts to collec	t the special assessment are no	t likely to be effective.

* Findings for the total amount of losses are required under Chapters 109A, 110, 110A, and 113A of Title 18 for offenses committed on or after September 13, 1994, but before April 23, 1996.

Judgment -- Page 5 of 6

SCHEDULE OF PAYMENTS

Having assessed the defendant's ability to pay, payment of the total criminal monetary penalties is due as follows:

- Lump sum payment of \$500.00 due immediately, balance due Α
 - □ not later than \boxtimes in accordance with $\square C$, $\square D$, $\square E$, or $\boxtimes F$ below; or

B \square Payment to begin immediately (may be combined with \square C, \square D, or \square F below); or

- Payment in equal _____ installments of ______ over a period of ______, to commence _____ days C after the date of this judgment; or
- Payment in equal ______ installments of ______ over a period of ______, to commence _____ days D after release from imprisonment to a term of supervision; or
- Payment during the term of supervised release will commence within _____ days after release from imprisonment. The court E will set the payment plan based on an assessment of the defendant's ability to pay at that time; or
- F Special instructions regarding the payment of criminal monetary penalties:
 - Payable to: Clerk, U.S. District Court, Attn: Finance, P.O. Box 61010, Houston, TX 77208. Balance due in payments of the greater of \$25 per quarter or 50% of any wages earned while in prison in accordance with the Bureau of Prisons' Inmate Financial Responsibility Program. Any balance remaining after release from imprisonment shall be paid in equal monthly installments of \$200 or 10% of the defendant's gross earnings, whichever is greater, to commence 60 days after the release to a term of supervision.

Unless the court has expressly ordered otherwise, if this judgment imposes imprisonment, payment of criminal monetary penalties is due during imprisonment. All criminal monetary penalties, except those payments made through the Federal Bureau of Prisons' Inmate Financial Responsibility Program, are made to the clerk of the court.

The defendant shall receive credit for all payments previously made toward any criminal monetary penalties imposed.

□ Joint and Several

Case Number			
Defendant and Co-Defendant Names		Joint and Several	Corresponding Payee,
(including defendant number)	<u>Total Amount</u>	<u>Amount</u>	if appropriate

ppropriate

Judgment -- Page 6 of 6

See Additional Defendants and Co-Defendants Held Joint and Several.

The defendant shall pay the cost of prosecution.

The defendant shall pay the following court cost(s):

□ The defendant shall forfeit the defendant's interest in the following property to the United States:

See Additional Forfeited Property.

Payments shall be applied in the following order: (1) assessment, (2) restitution principal, (3) restitution interest, (4) fine principal, (5) fine interest, (6) community restitution, (7) penalties, and (8) costs, including cost of prosecution and court costs.

<u>AFFIDAVIT</u>

THE STATE OF TEXAS § COUNTY OF TRAVIS §

BEFORE ME, the undersigned authority, on this day personally appeared Rebecca (Beth) Stevens, Petitioner's attorney of record, who, being by me duly sworn, deposed as follows:

"My name is Rebecca (Beth) Stevens. I am over the age of 18 years, of sound mind, capable of making this affidavit, and state the following:

Based upon information and belief, Gwendolyn F. Climmons, whose Texas Bar Card Number is 04390000, is licensed as an attorney and counselor at law in the State of Texas. Based upon information and belief, Gwendolyn F. Climmons, named as Respondent in the Petition for Compulsory Discipline filed with the Board of Disciplinary Appeals is one and the same person as the Gwendolyn Climmons-Johnson who is the subject of the Judgment in a Criminal Case imposed in Case No.4:12CR00245-001, styled *United States of America v. Gwendolyn Climmons-Johnson*, in the United States District Court for the Southern District of Texas, Holding Session in Houston, wherein Respondent was found guilty of Count 1 – Conspiracy to commit healthcare fraud, and Counts 2-5 – Health care fraud, aiding and abetting, and was committed to the custody of the United States Bureau of Prisons to be imprisoned for a term of 97 months as to each of Counts 1 through 5, to run concurrently, for a total term of 97 months and was ordered upon release from imprisonment to be on supervised release for 3 years, ordered to pay an assessment of \$500.00 and restitution in the amount of \$972,132.22."

FURTHER Affiant saith not.

Rebecca (Beth) Stevens

SWORN AND SUBSCRIBED before me on the 12 day of 11/1/2015.

SHELLY M. HOGUE NOTARY PUBLIC State of Texas mm. Exp. 10-05-2018

NOTARY PUBLIC IN AND FOR THE STATE OF TEXAS

Exhibit